

Increasing Enrollment in Michigan's Teacher Preparation Programs: Findings from a Scan of Innovative Policies and Practices

A Region 8 Comprehensive Center Report



Contents

Introduction	1
Purpose and Overview	1
Methodology	2
Selected Findings	2
Overview of Selected Policies and Initiatives	2
Expanded Descriptions of Selected Policies and Initiatives	8
Conclusion: Key Considerations	15
References	17
Appendix A. Program Strategies Aligned to Focus Areas	19
Appendix B. List of Programs Reviewed	20
Appendix C. Detailed Methodology	22

The contents of this document were developed under a grant from the U.S. Department of Education through the Office of Program and Grantee Support Services (PGSS) within the Office of Elementary and Secondary Education (OESE), by the Region 8 Comprehensive Center at ICF under Award #S283B190013. This contains resources that are provided for the reader's convenience. These materials may contain the views and recommendations of various subject matter experts as well as hypertext links, contact addresses, and websites to information created and maintained by other public and private organizations. The U.S. Department of Education does not control or guarantee the accuracy, relevance, timeliness, or completeness of any outside information included in these materials. The views expressed herein do not necessarily represent the positions or policies of the U.S. Department of Education. No official endorsement by the U.S. Department of Education of any product, commodity, service, enterprise, curriculum, or program of instruction mentioned in this document is intended or should be inferred.

Introduction

Decades of research confirm that teachers have the most significant impact on student achievement. High-quality, high-performing teachers have been found to have both short- and long-term impacts on student educational outcomes. In fact, teachers have been shown to have two to three times the effect of any other school factor (Opper, 2019). These findings underscore the importance of ensuring that all students have equitable access to well-prepared teachers. This report provides insight into policies and practices for building a pipeline of teachers to alleviate shortages and promote equity of access.

Michigan is facing a looming teacher shortage, with trends in teacher certification mirroring a nationwide decline by race, gender, and subject matter (Partelow, 2019). In Michigan, many school districts are already struggling to find educators qualified to teach math, science, and special education (Citizens Research Council of Michigan, 2019). Furthermore, in Fall 2019, an investigation from The Center for Michigan found that long-term substitute teachers were leading more than 2,500 Michigan classrooms (The Center for Michigan, 2020).

There are many challenges to recruiting teachers, including relatively low salaries, a decline in job security, and an overall decline in teacher job satisfaction—which in 2012 fell to just 39 percent (Croft, Guffy, & Vitale, 2018). Teachers' salaries are not competitive with those in other labor markets requiring similar levels of education. This challenge is compounded by the rising cost of higher education. Evidence suggests that willingness to enter a lower paying field is tied to the level of debt that students carry (Podolsky et al., 2016). Across the nation, States and districts have adopted evaluation systems that take students' academic achievement into account, which may have dissuaded some new teachers from entering the profession. These factors, as well as shrinking budgets in some schools, may play a role in teachers' declining job satisfaction (Croft, Guffy, & Vitale, 2018).

In many States and districts, the degrees of prospective educators do not align with the needs of the field. Of the high-need fields identified by the U.S. Department of Education (bilingual education and English language acquisition, foreign language, math, reading, science, and special education), only special education is among the most frequently earned degrees. Furthermore, despite efforts to recruit diverse students, colleges of education do not reflect the diversity of PK-12 schools. In 2018, more than 50 percent of students in public schools were students of color, in contrast to just 25 percent of prospective educators in schools of education (American Association of Colleges of Teacher Education, 2018).

Purpose and Overview

The purpose of this report is to support the Michigan Department of Education (MDE) in identifying innovative strategies for expanding the teacher pipeline in Michigan. In this report, we provide selected findings from a comprehensive scan of policies and practices designed to grow the pipeline of educators by expanding enrollment and retention in preparation programs across the nation. We include a sub-focus on programs designed to increase the diversity of prospective educators. For each program, we provide detail on key areas of focus (grow your own, educator preparation program modifications, certification process change, marketing, diversity, and financial incentives), major strategies, required funding, and any evidence of success. Finally, we offer considerations for the MDE based on an analysis of these programs. (Appendix B includes a full list of the policies and initiatives explored.)

Methodology

To complete this scan, we worked closely with the MDE to identify the following focus: Improve the MDE’s understanding of programs and initiatives that are implemented across the nation and designed to expand the teacher pipeline. (See Appendix C for more detailed information about our methodology.) After identifying a focus, we engaged in a review of literature and publicly available program information. To guide and focus our review of available data, we developed an inquiry framework, looking specifically to use collected information to answer the following questions:

- ◀ What policies/initiatives exist for increasing enrollment in teacher preparation programs?
- ◀ Who is leading the work?
- ◀ How effective is it? What does the data show?

We entered information into an Excel data collection template, reviewing a total of 80 initiatives and screening more than 176 articles and program websites. Additionally, we validated and triangulated data collected from the scan of initiatives through email inquiries to program administrators. This report synthesizes the article scan, website reviews, and program administrator input (where applicable). We selected the 27 programs presented in this report for their relevance to the scan’s areas of focus; availability of information on strategies, funding, evidence of effectiveness; or alignment with key areas of interest for the MDE.

Selected Findings

This section highlights 27 policies or initiatives that address focus areas in the categories highlighted in the figure below: grow your own, educator preparation program modifications, certification process change, marketing, diversity, and financial incentives. These categories are not mutually exclusive. In fact, programs that address multiple focus areas are more successful, particularly in recruiting and supporting educators of color (Putnam et al., 2016).











Focus Area Categories






























Overview of Selected Policies and Initiatives













The following table provides an overview of selected policies and initiatives, including icons indicating the relevant areas of focus described above. Programs are organized by State. The table includes hyperlinks to more detailed descriptions of each program. Appendix A lists the key strategies across these programs that are aligned to each focus area.







Table 1. Highlights from Selected Policies and Initiatives

Initiative Name	State	Areas of Focus	Major Strategies	Data	Funding Provided	Dates in Operation	Expanded Description
Teach Arkansas	AR	 MARKETING	Online career information; advertising campaign; preparation for licensure exams	No evidence of effect	Amount unpublished	2018–Present	Pg. 8
California Center on Teaching Careers	CA	 MARKETING	Centralized job bank; online career information	No evidence of effect	\$5M	2017–Present	Pg. 8
Multilingual/Multicultural Teacher Preparation Center	CA	 DIVERSITY  EDUCATOR PREP MODIFICATIONS	Coaching/mentoring; teacher preparation curriculum	Initial positive response	Amount unpublished	2001–Present	Pg. 8
San Francisco Teaching Residency	CA	 GROW YOUR OWN  DIVERSITY  CERTIFICATION PROCESS CHANGE  FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	District & IHE partnership; tuition remission; loans/loan forgiveness; teacher residency; coaching/mentoring; induction support	Positive data trends	\$2.2M	2010–Present	Pg. 8
Colorado Teacher Cadets and the Center for Rural Education at the University of Northern Colorado	CO	 GROW YOUR OWN  FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	Teacher cadet; support for rural communities; articulation agreements; scholarships	Positive data trends	\$2.2M (to expand to rural districts)	2001–Present	Pg. 8–9

Initiative Name	State	Areas of Focus	Major Strategies	Data	Funding Provided	Dates in Operation	Expanded Description
Pathways2Teaching	CO	   GROW YOUR OWN DIVERSITY FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	District & IHE partnership; articulation agreements; scholarships	Initial positive response	Amount unpublished	2010–Present	Pg. 9
Leeward Community College Teacher Education Program	HI	  GROW YOUR OWN EDUCATOR PREP MODIFICATIONS	Articulation agreements; coaching/mentoring	Positive data trends	\$2.64M	2005–Present	Pg. 9
Minority Teachers of Illinois Scholarship Program	IL	  DIVERSITY FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	Scholarships; loans/loan forgiveness	Positive data trends	\$3.1M	1991–Present	Pg. 9
Be a Teacher LA	LA	 MARKETING	Online career information; advertising campaign	No evidence of effect	Amount unpublished	2018–Present	Pg. 9
Believe and Prepare	LA	   GROW YOUR OWN EDUCATOR PREP MODIFICATIONS FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	District & IHE partnerships; teacher residency; coaching/mentoring; support for rural communities; program grants	Initial positive response	\$4.89M	2014–Present	Pg. 10
Collaborative Urban and Greater Minnesota Educators of Color Grant Program	MN	  DIVERSITY FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	Program grants; scholarships; coaching/mentoring; induction support	No evidence of effect	\$1.1M	2018–2021	Pg. 10

Initiative Name	State	Areas of Focus	Major Strategies	Data	Funding Provided	Dates in Operation	Expanded Description
North Carolina Teaching Fellows	NC	  GROW YOUR OWN FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	Scholarships; loans/loan forgiveness; mentoring/coaching	Positive data trends	\$1.45M	2017–Present	Pg. 10
Oklahoma Bilingual Teacher Pipeline Project	OK	  DIVERSITY FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	District & IHE partnership; paid student teaching	Initial positive response	\$91.1K	2016–Present	Pg. 10
Oregon Teacher Scholars Program	OR	  DIVERSITY FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	Scholarships	Initial positive response	\$500K	2018–Present	Pg. 10
Call Me MISTER	SC	   GROW YOUR OWN DIVERSITY FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	Scholarships; coaching/mentoring; preparation for licensure exams; job placement	Positive data trends	Amount unpublished	2000–Present	Pg. 11
South Carolina Teacher Cadet Program	SC	  GROW YOUR OWN DIVERSITY	Teacher cadet; articulation agreements	Positive data trends	\$35K	1985–Present	Pg. 11
South Carolina Teaching Fellows	SC	  GROW YOUR OWN FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	Scholarships; loans/loan forgiveness; mentoring/coaching	Positive data trends	\$3.3M	1999–Present	Pg. 11
South Carolina's Dedication to Education Campaign	SC	 MARKETING	Online career information; advertising campaign	No evidence of effect	>\$500K	2018–Present	Pg. 11

Initiative Name	State	Areas of Focus	Major Strategies	Data	Funding Provided	Dates in Operation	Expanded Description
EdTPA (in lieu of Praxis)	TN	  CERTIFICATION PROCESS CHANGE DIVERSITY	Performance assessments for licensure	No evidence of effect	Amount unpublished	2018–Present	Pg. 11
Memphis Teacher Residency Program	TN	  GROW YOUR OWN FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	Coaching/mentoring; teacher preparation curriculum/housing and living stipend	Positive data trends	~\$2M	2009–Present	Pg. 11–12
Minority Teaching Fellows Program	TN	   GROW YOUR OWN DIVERSITY FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	Scholarships; Loans/loan forgiveness	Data findings unknown	\$793.9K	1989–Present	Pg. 12
River City Partnership	TN	  GROW YOUR OWN CERTIFICATION PROCESS CHANGE	Preparation for licensure exams; coaching/mentoring; induction support; job placement; district & IHE partnership	No evidence of effect	Amount unpublished	2018–Present	Pg. 12
Teach Today. Change Tomorrow.	TN	 MARKETING	Online career information; advertising campaign	Initial positive response	\$400K	2017–Present	Pg. 12
Academy for Teacher Excellence	TX	  EDUCATOR PREP MODIFICATIONS DIVERSITY	District & IHE partnership; teacher preparation curriculum; induction support	Promising data trends	Amount unpublished	2003–Present	Pg. 12

Initiative Name	State	Areas of Focus	Major Strategies	Data	Funding Provided	Dates in Operation	Expanded Description
Texas Grow Your Own	TX	  GROW YOUR OWN EDUCATOR PREP MODIFICATIONS	Program grants; teacher cadet; articulation agreements; district & IHE partnership; teacher residency	Initial positive response	\$2.75M	2018–Present	Pg. 12–13
Recruiting Washington Teachers	WA	  GROW YOUR OWN DIVERSITY	District & IHE partnership; teacher cadet	Positive data trends	≤\$21,500/district	2007–Present	Pg. 13
Minority Teacher Loan Program	WI	  DIVERSITY FINANCIAL INCENTIVES	Loans/loan forgiveness	No evidence of effect	\$519K (2 years)	2019–Present	Pg. 13

Expanded Descriptions of Selected Policies and Initiatives

Teach Arkansas

Led by the Arkansas Department of Education, Teach Arkansas is a marketing campaign to encourage more Arkansans to consider teaching as a profession. The campaign focuses on recruiting teachers into the teaching profession, supporting existing teachers, and encouraging those who have left the profession to return. Teach Arkansas provides online career information and hosts events for current and future educators, including preparation for licensure assessments. The campaign also includes a video series and social media hashtag.

California Center on Teaching Careers

A State-funded partnership between the Tulare County Office of Education and the California State University (Bakersfield), the California Center on Teaching Careers (the Center) is designed to elevate the teaching profession through attracting new and existing talent to California's classrooms. The Center provides online career information, virtual and in-person job fairs, individualized career pathways, and a centralized job bank. State legislation includes \$35 million for programs aimed at curbing teacher shortages, including \$5 million to create the California Center on Teaching Careers.

Multilingual/Multicultural Teacher Preparation Center

Offered by the Bilingual/Multicultural Education Department (BMED) at California State University—Sacramento, the Multilingual/Multicultural Teacher Preparation Center (M/M Center) is a teacher preparation program for low-income and culturally and linguistically diverse candidates. The program prepares teachers to teach in low-income and culturally and linguistically diverse classrooms, schools, and communities through a curriculum that centers on educational equity coupled with access to mentoring and support in the areas of financial aid, tutoring, and certification assistance. In a study of 2001 and 2002 program completers (Enchandia, Wong, Murai, Bérta-Ávila, William-White, & Baker, 2007), researchers found that 80 percent of graduates from each cohort were teaching in low-income and culturally and linguistically diverse settings. Seventy-five percent of students are students of color and white students are bilingual. Additionally, in alignment with the M/M Center's goals, candidates are twice as likely to implement strategies for creating democratic classroom structures and developing multicultural curriculum.

San Francisco Teaching Residency

A partnership between San Francisco Unified School District (SFUSD), Stanford University, University of San Francisco, and United Educators of San Francisco (Union), the San Francisco Teaching Residency (SFTR) offers aspiring educators the chance to apprentice in San Francisco public schools while participating in a weekly practicum course and receiving coaching and mentoring. Residents receive stipends and housing grants, free healthcare benefits, and tuition remission or significant scholarship support and loan forgiveness in exchange for teaching for at least three years in SFUSD. Graduates of the program are guaranteed contracts with the district and continue to receive induction support. SFTR's operating budget (for preparing a cohort of 32 residents, 22 first year teachers, and 22 second year teachers) for the 2015–16 school year was about \$2.2 million. According to a report from the Learning Policy Institute (Carver-Thomas, 2018), SFTR graduates have higher retention rates than other beginning teachers (89 percent compared to 38 percent for other SFTR new hires and 20 percent for Teach for America). Ninety-seven percent of graduates are still teaching. Additionally, SFTR graduates are perceived by SFUSD principals as more effective than other new teachers, and students taught by SFTR graduates have higher levels of confidence in their teachers' competence (based on the YouthTruth Student Survey). Sixty-six percent of graduates identify as teachers of color, compared with 49 percent of SFUSD teachers as a whole.

Colorado Teacher Cadets and the Center for Rural Education

Since 2001, the Colorado Department of Higher Education has administered a Teacher Cadet program to provide training to high school students to become educators and earn credits toward a college degree. The program is funded by a State grant, which is supplemented by Federal Perkins funds. (To qualify for Perkins funding, the Colorado Teacher Cadets modified the South Carolina Teacher Cadet model to intentionally weave in CTE.) In 2016, the State awarded a \$2.2 million grant to the University of Northern Colorado to incentivize more rural students into teaching through expanding the Teacher Cadet program into rural regions and providing scholarships to students who commit to teaching for two years in rural communities after graduation. Colorado's Teacher Cadet program is operating in 38 high schools and 22 districts across the State.

Pathways2Teaching

Led by the University of Colorado—Denver, the Pathways2Teaching (P2T) program is designed to encourage students from underserved communities to explore teaching as a career while examining critical issues in educational and social justice. As a part of the college prep program, students engage in field experiences, gain college readiness skills, and get the support necessary to navigate the college admission process. Students participate in field experiences, with the potential to earn college credits for their work. In Denver, P2T students are also eligible for a scholarship to study education at the University of Colorado—Denver. The program has expanded to Boulder, Colorado; Nashville, Tennessee; and eastern Oregon. According to a report from the Council for Chief State School Officers (Gill, 2017), as of 2013, 100 percent of the first P2T cohort were taking college courses, and 18 percent had declared an education major, exceeding national averages. In the first seven years of the program, 43 percent of enrollees were Latinx and African American males.

Leeward Community College Teacher Education Program

Partnering with a local institution of higher education, Leeward Community College offers a “2+2” program to “home grow” teachers in the community. The Associate of Arts in Teaching degree offers candidates, many of whom are from Native Hawaiian communities, the option to become paraeducators or to continue to a 4-year university seeking teacher licensure. The program includes field experience and numerous supports, including peer mentoring and intensive academic counseling. High school students who have participated in the State’s Teacher Academy may qualify for advanced standing in the program. Annual funding for the program is \$2.64 million in private and Federal grants. Over the past decade, enrollment in the college has increased from 24 to 500, in a period when teacher preparation enrollment is declining nationally. Other community colleges, including Elizabeth City State University in North Carolina, have established similar programs.

Minority Teachers of Illinois Scholarship Program

Funded by the Illinois Student Assistance Commission, the Minority Teachers of Illinois (MTI) Scholarship Program offers scholarships of up to \$5,000 per year to students of color who plan to teach at a nonprofit Illinois public, private, or parochial elementary or secondary school at which no less than 30 percent of the students are students of color. If students do not meet this obligation, the scholarship converts to a loan. In 2003, the program was funded at \$3.1 million. A 2003 study of the ITEACH Teacher Shortage Scholarship Program and the MTI Scholarship Program found that, by the 2001–02 school year, 64 percent of the 3,000 scholarship recipients had completed their teaching obligations for the scholarships, and an additional 22 percent were still completing their obligation (Illinois Governor’s Council on Educator Quality, 2002).

Be a Teacher LA

The Louisiana Department of Education’s “Be a Teacher LA” campaign seeks to increase the number of high school graduates and college students who enroll in an undergraduate teacher preparation program and enter Louisiana classrooms. Developed in partnership with a marketing firm, the campaign targets high school juniors and seniors, and college freshmen and sophomores. It also aims to reach parents and counselors, who often help guide students’ career decisions. Resources include videos and printable materials, including information on career pathways and career advancement opportunities.

Believe and Prepare

Led by the Louisiana Department of Education, Believe and Prepare is focused on providing support for closer partnerships between preparation providers and school system leaders to offer aspiring teachers a full year of practice under an expert mentor and a competency-based curriculum. Undergraduate residents receive a \$2,000 stipend; mentor teachers receive a \$1,000 stipend and professional development. The program also includes support for rural communities, including additional alternate certification candidate support and mentoring. Funding includes \$4,890,000 in grant funding to three cohorts of school systems. Since 2014, Believe and Prepare has expanded to over 30 school systems and over 20 preparation providers. In 3 years, the program supported over 850 undergraduate teacher candidates.

Collaborative Urban and Greater Minnesota Educators of Color Grant Program

Administered by the Minnesota Professional Educator Licensing Standards Board with support from the Offices of Higher Education and Grants Management, the Collaborative Urban and Greater Minnesota Educators of Color program grants are competitive grants open to approved traditional and alternative teacher preparation programs to fund programs focused on providing recruitment, retention, and induction support to teacher candidates who are of color or who are American Indian. For 2020, the Minnesota legislature appropriated \$1.1 million for the grants. The program awarded six grants in 2020, ranging from \$100,000 to \$406,000.

North Carolina Teaching Fellows

Originally established in 1986, the North Carolina Teaching Fellows Program is a competitive scholarship program that offers up to \$8,250 annually to prospective educators. Students must commit to teaching in STEM (science, technology, engineering, and mathematics) or special education in a North Carolina public school. Educators who choose to teach in low-performing schools must commit to teach one year for each year of the award. Educators teaching in higher performing schools must teach 2 years for each year of the award. If individuals do not complete their teaching commitment, the scholarship is converted into a loan with 10 percent interest. Legislation established a trust fund for the program, with up to \$1.45 million available for the program each year. According to a 2012 report, 75 percent of the fellows are still teaching in North Carolina public schools after 5 years (Henry, Bastian, & Smith, 2015).

Oklahoma Bilingual Teacher Pipeline Project

Established by the Oklahoma City Public Schools, the Oklahoma Bilingual Teacher Pipeline Project supports bilingual paraprofessionals to become teachers in Oklahoma City Public Schools. In return for being paid as paraprofessionals while student-teaching for certification, individuals must commit to teaching for 3 years in Oklahoma City Public Schools. In 2019, the Foundation for Oklahoma City Public Schools established a second pipeline to target teachers of color following the success of the original project. The foundation funds both projects, which spent a combined \$91,109 in 2018. In 2019–20, the programs supported 71 participants. The first two graduates from the project took on their own classrooms in fall 2019.

Oregon Teacher Scholars Program

Managed by the Oregon Higher Education Coordinating Commission's Office of Student Access and Completion and the Chief Education Office, the Oregon Teacher Scholars Program (OTSP) offers \$5,000 scholarships for up to 2 years for culturally or linguistically diverse teacher candidates. Recipients also include networking and training opportunities. This initiative is part of a larger State focus on educator equity, led by the Oregon Educator Equity Advisory (EAC) Group. State legislation authorizes Oregon's EAC to distribute more than \$40 million in funds, including \$500,000 in State funding per year for OTSP. According to the State's educator equity report (Chief Education Office, 2019), OTSP will support 136 scholarships in 2019–12. In 2018–19, OTSP awarded 69 scholarships to racially or linguistically diverse teacher candidates. Of the 39 scholars scheduled to graduate in 2019, the majority reported their employment in Oregon school districts.

Call Me MISTER (Mentors Instructing Students Toward Effective Role Models)

Founded at Clemson University, Call Me MISTER (Mentors Instructing Students Toward Effective Role Models) is a leadership program designed to prepare African American male teachers to teach in South Carolina schools. The comprehensive system of support includes loan forgiveness, mentorship, academic and peer support, preparation for State licensure exams, and assistance with job placement. Participants commit to teaching in a local school for each year they receive financial support. The program maintains contact with graduates, and graduates are expected to become mentors to new program participants. As of 2018, 100 percent of the program's approximately 150 graduates remain in education, and 95 percent are teaching in South Carolina (Carver-Thomas, 2018).

South Carolina Teacher Cadet Program

Managed by the State-funded Center for Educator Recruitment, Retention and Advancement (CERRA), the primary goal of the Teacher Cadet Program in South Carolina is to encourage high school students to consider teaching as a career. A secondary goal of the program is to develop future community leaders who will become civic advocates for public education. The dual credit accrual course is taught for a minimum of one class period per day for a year or the equivalent of that amount of time in contact hours. In 2015–16, the South Carolina Teacher Cadet Program received \$35,730 out of a total State budget of \$4,435,725 for CERRA. According to the program (CERRA, n.d.), of the 2,991 students who have completed the Teacher Cadets course in South Carolina, 34 percent are nonwhite and 23 percent are male. After completion of the course, 35 percent of students said that they plan to pursue a career in teaching.

South Carolina Teaching Fellows

Administered by CERRA, the South Carolina Teaching Fellows program is designed to recruit high school seniors into the teaching profession. Students receive a forgivable loan of up to \$24,000 (\$6,000 per year of college). In addition, they participate in enrichment and professional development opportunities. Fellows commit to teach in a South Carolina public school for every year they receive a loan. The program receives \$3.3 million in State funds. Based on a 2011 report (Garret & Hallman), the program has a 74 percent program completion rate compared to a 55 percent graduation rate among all South Carolina institutions that offer teacher education programs. In 2011, seventy-one percent of all graduated fellows were employed in a South Carolina school district. Eighty-five percent of all fellows remained in the classroom after satisfying their loan commitment.

South Carolina's Dedication to Education Campaign

South Carolina Department of Education's "Dedication to Education" campaign provides online information to prospective educators. The campaign has included advertising via television, YouTube, and social media to improve the image of public schools and to attract teachers. In 2018, South Carolina spent \$500,000 on the campaign.

edTPA

Tennessee now requires all teaching candidates to submit edTPA scores for licensure rather than taking the Praxis. Developed by Stanford University faculty and resources, edTPA is a nationally standardized evaluation system now in use by teacher preparation programs in some 40 States. Research indicates that performance assessments like edTPA are both more predictive of classroom effectiveness and less likely to produce large racial disparities in pass rates than multiple choice standardized tests (Carver-Thomas, 2018). Universities in Tennessee have been part of a national pilot of edTPA since 2011.

Memphis Teacher Residency Program

Memphis Teacher Residency is a nonprofit organization that partners with Shelby County Public Schools and Union University to administer The Memphis Teacher Residency Program, which aims to recruit and train teachers for Memphis high needs schools. Teacher candidates complete a 1-year residency where they receive instructional coaching, mentorship, teacher certification, and a master's degree in urban education. The program also supports residents by providing a housing and living stipend. Upon graduation, residents agree to a 3-year teaching commitment. The nonprofit received almost \$5 million in funding from various sources. Of the \$8 million in State funds allocated support teacher and principal residency programs, \$2 million is used to support the Memphis Residency Program. A 2014 study of the program found that graduates had higher student achievement gains than other beginning teachers and larger gains than veteran teachers on most of the State assessments (Tennessee Higher Education Commission, 2014). MTR graduates also see greater retention, with 95 percent still teaching in Tennessee public schools in Year 3 compared with 41 percent of teachers Statewide.

Minority Teaching Fellows Program

Administered by the Tennessee Student Assistance Commission (TSAC), the Minority Teaching Fellows Program is designed to encourage minority students to become teachers in Tennessee. Students pursuing certification at an eligible Tennessee college or university receive an award of \$5,000 per year. Fellows must teach in a Tennessee public school for 1 year for each year they receive the award. Based on State legislation, the program may receive up to \$793,978 per year in State funding. The TSAC Board of Directors annual meeting minutes (2016) show a decline in awards from year to year starting in 2013–2014. In 2015–16, there were 62 recipients, compared to 73 in the previous year and 86 recipients in 2013–14.

River City Partnership

The River City Partnership is a relationship between the University of Memphis and Shelby County Schools (including the Achievement School district and local charters) created in 2018 to address the district's teacher shortages and create a teaching force with greater cultural awareness. The partnership seeks to recruit and prepare future teachers to teach in Memphis schools. The program provides appreciative advising, academic support, licensure exam preparation, job placement, and 2 years of post-graduate professional development and mentorship.

Teach Today. Change Tomorrow

An initiative of the State Collaborative on Reforming Education (SCORE), “Teach Today. Change Tomorrow.” is a Statewide campaign to recruit future educators in Tennessee. In addition to a social media presence, SCORE hired a creative agency to create a website that serves as a central hub for prospective teachers in Tennessee. Supported by grants from foundations, SCORE spent an estimated \$250,000 and \$400,000 on the campaign—mostly for advertising.

Academy for Teacher Excellence

The Academy for Teacher Excellence (ATE) at the University of Texas at San Antonio (UTSA) is a comprehensive model designed to prepare teacher candidates for employment in linguistically and culturally diverse communities and increase the number of Latino students pursuing teacher certification. Grounded in the “Culturally Efficacious Teacher” model, ATE includes a learning community, research and professional development support for faculty, partnerships with schools, and induction support for new teachers. In a study of ATE’s learning community, researchers found that, in the course of 5 years, UTSA improved passing rates from 70 percent to 97 percent on the teacher certification exam; learning community participants’ grade point averages were significantly higher in comparison to a randomly selected group of non-participating students; and retention rates were high, with only 14 of 351 students leaving the program. The large majority (90 percent) of the students participating in the learning community were Latino (Flores, Clark, Claeys, & Villarreal, 2007).

Texas Grow Your Own

The Grow Your Own (GYO) grant program is designed to elevate the teaching profession in Texas. Districts and teacher preparation programs are eligible for grants to develop education and training courses at the high school level, to support current staff to obtain their teaching credentials, or to provide teacher residency models to prospective educators. The State budgeted \$2,750,000 for the most recent cycle of grants, awarded in 2020. The Texas Education Agency website indicates that the 2019 GYO grants funded more than 150 paraeducators to become certified educators, almost 100 teacher candidates to participate in clinical teaching placements, and 52 high schools to expand or start education and training programs.

Recruiting Washington Teachers

Managed by the Washington Professional Educator Standards Board, Recruiting Washington Teachers (RWT) is a high school teacher academy program designed to recruit and support diverse future teachers. Each academy includes classroom field experiences, a specialized course introducing the teaching profession, advising, college visits, and a summer institute. Each year, Washington provides competitive grants of up to \$21,500 per year to districts for the teacher academies. According to a 2018–19 program snapshot (The Professional Education Standards Board, 2019), RWT participants have an average on-time graduation rate of 96 percent, compared to 79 percent Statewide. Additionally, 87 percent of participating seniors applied to and were accepted into college in 2019. In 2018, the program also began a pilot RWT initiative focused on future bilingual teachers.

Minority Teacher Loan Program

Administered by Wisconsin's Higher Educational Aids Board, the Minority Teacher Loan Program provides loans and loan forgiveness to minority teachers who work in school districts with at least 40 percent minority students. The program offers up to \$30,000 in loans for eligible students seeking undergraduate degrees in teaching and forgives 25 percent of the loan amount for every year they spend teaching in a qualifying school district. State legislation provides for \$519,000 in funding for 2 years.

Conclusion: Key Considerations

As the MDE explores strategies for increasing enrollment in educator preparation programs, the State can build on existing policies and initiatives within the areas of focus described in this report (grow your own, educator preparation program modifications, certification process change, marketing, diversity, and financial incentives). Already, the MDE is working to encourage districts to invest in grow-your-own programs, including State-led teacher cadet and other education career and technical education programs; building partnerships with the Michigan Education Association, American Federation of Teachers Michigan, the Michigan Association of School Administrators, and Michigan State University; and investing in educator recognition efforts, including the #proudMeducator campaign, to market the profession with a focus on diverse educators. Through our scan, we identified the following key considerations for the MDE in continuing and expanding this work:

◀ **Teacher pipeline initiatives require sustainable funding to operate.**

- Initiatives have varying budgets but depend upon funding to ensure quality of support or guaranteed incentives for teacher candidates.
- Some initiatives leverage the use of paid personnel that manage key functions, including partnership development, elements of training and mentorship, and program development.

◀ **Partnerships and relationships are critical to the creation of comprehensive programs.**

- Programs have found success in prioritizing mentor relationships between current teachers and teacher candidates.
- Partnerships between universities and districts can be a powerful asset. These partnerships can support co-taught trainings or co-created curriculum, as well as alignment between mentorship and core program teachings, and may provide additional research and funding opportunities.
- Relationships between districts and program administrators can support directly connected job placement—strengthening both recruitment and retention efforts.
- A range of partners enables more access to robust services, as partners can offer training, financial support, job placement, and supportive services to navigate the certification process.

◀ **Programs that effectively recruit, retain, and support minority candidates share key characteristics.**

- These programs typically take a systemic approach, tackling multiple barriers to teaching (awareness of career pathways in teaching, finances, college access, and testing and certification).





- The programs demonstrate a commitment to eliminating obstacles related to flawed or biased testing and program admission requirements, while maintaining high standards for new teachers. For example, the San Francisco Teaching Residency has used a conditional admission process to assist several candidates of color and white candidates with gaining program acceptance prior to passing California’s required exams. The Multilingual/Multicultural Teacher Preparation Center provides peer support networks and a range of resources to aid in the credential application process.
 - The programs practice high-touch, relational, and community driven recruitment, which includes actively prioritizing and following-up with prospective applicants of color, building relationships, and offering support.
- ◀ **Financial incentives have been effective in attracting teachers, but the design of the incentive matters.**
- The size of the incentive matters. Amounts between \$1,000–\$3,000 annually are often too low to address large student loan debt, specifically for minority candidates.
 - Programs should consider relationships between incentives and compensation models.
- ◀ **Marketing initiatives vary, with limited information on or efforts to evaluate their effectiveness.**
- States and non-profits often struggle to sustain marketing campaigns beyond 1–2 years, particularly a social media and video presence.
 - The field lacks a robust framework for evaluating the success of marketing initiatives. Campaigns typically track data on website or social media hits but lack the mechanisms to understand the impact on the teacher pipeline.
- ◀ **State agencies have played critical roles in addressing pipeline issues.**
- State agencies can advocate to legislation to ensure potential for greater funding sustainability.
 - State agencies can serve as grant-makers, offering competitive grant opportunities to spark innovation among teacher academies or residency programs like Recruiting Washington Teachers.
- ◀ **Determining the most effective way to collect and track data on initiatives continues to be a challenge and barrier to understanding the impact of teacher pipeline programs.**
- The challenge may be related to systems and structures that exist to collect, store, and analyze robust data, or related to the ability to define metrics beyond recruitment, enrollment, and retention.

References

- American Association of Colleges for Teacher Education (2018). *Colleges of Education: A National Portrait*. Retrieved from: <https://aacte.org/colleges-of-education-a-national-portrait/>.
- Carver-Thomas, D. (2018). *Diversifying the Teaching Profession: How to Recruit and Retain Teachers of Color*. Palo-Alto, CA: Learning Policy Institute. Retrieved from: <https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/product/diversifying-teaching-profession-report>.
- Center for Educator Recruitment, Retention, and Advancement (n.d.). *Research*. Retrieved from <https://www.teachercadets.com/research.html>.
- Chief Education Office (2019). *Oregon Educator Equity Report*. Retrieved from: https://www.oregon.gov/eac/Documents/FINAL_Ed%20Equity%20Rpt_2019_9.5.19.pdf.
- Citizens Research Council of Michigan (2019). *Michigan's Leaky Teacher Pipeline: Examining Trends in Teacher Supply and Demand*. Retrieved from: <https://crcmich.org/publications/michigans-leaky-teacher-pipeline-examining-trends-in-teacher-demand-and-supply>.
- Croft, M., Guffy, G., & Vitale, D. (2018). *Encouraging More High School Students to Consider Teaching*. ACT. Retrieved from: <https://www.act.org/content/act/en/research/pdfs/P1000-encouraging-teaching-2018-06.html>.
- Enchandia, A., Wong, P.L., Murai, H., Bérta-Ávila, M., William-White, L., Baker, S., Arellano, A., & Echandia, A. (2007). *Meeting the Demand for Multi-Cultural, Multilingual Teacher Preparation*. *Teacher Education Quarterly*, 34(4), 9-25.
- Garrett, J. & Hallman, J. (2011). *The South Carolina Teaching Fellows Program: Successfully Recruiting and Retaining Teachers*. Rock Hill, SC: Center for Educator Recruitment, Retention, and Advancement. Retrieved from: <https://www.cerra.org/uploads/1/7/6/8/17684955/tfreport.pdf>.
- Gill, J. (2017). *State Action: Strategies for Building the Teacher Pipeline*. Washington, DC: Council of Chief State School Officers. Retrieved from: <https://ccsso.org/resource-library/state-action-strategies-building-teacher-pipeline>.
- Henry, G.T., Bastian, K.C., & Smith, A.A. (2015). *The North Carolina Teaching Fellows Program: A Comprehensive Evaluation*. Chapel Hill, NC: The Education Policy Initiative at Carolina. Retrieved from: <https://publicpolicy.unc.edu/files/2015/07/The-NC-Teaching-Fellows-Program-A-Comprehensive-Evaluation.pdf>.
- Illinois Governor's Council on Educator Quality (2002). *Illinois policy inventory on teaching and learning*. Springfield, IL: Author. Retrieved from: https://www.siu.edu/ierc/pdf/2002_Policy_Inventory1.pdf.
- Opper, Isaac M., *Teachers Matter: Understanding Teachers' Impact on Student Achievement*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation, 2019. https://www.rand.org/pubs/research_reports/RR4312.html.

- Partelow, Lisette (2019). *What to Make of Declining Enrollment in Teacher Preparation Programs*. Washington, DC: Center for American Progress. Retrieved from: <https://www.americanprogress.org/issues/education-k-12/reports/2019/12/03/477311/make-declining-enrollment-teacher-preparation-programs/>.
- Podolsky, A., Kini, T., Bishop, J., & Darling-Hammond, L. (2016). *Solving the Teacher Shortage: How to Attract and Retain Excellent Educators*. Washington, DC: Learning Policy Institute. Retrieved from: <https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/product/solving-teacher-shortage>.
- Putnam, H., Hansen, M., Walsh, K., & Quintero, D. (2016). *High hopes and harsh realities: The real challenge to building a diverse teacher workforce*. Washington, DC: The Brookings Institution. Retrieved from: <https://www.brookings.edu/research/high-hopes-and-harsh-realities-the-real-challenges-to-building-a-diverse-teacher-workforce/>.
- Tennessee Higher Education Commission (2014). Tennessee teacher preparation report card, 2014 state profile. Nashville, TN: Author.
- Tennessee Student Assistance Corporation. (2016, September 27). *Board of Directors Meeting*. Nashville, TN. Retrieved from https://www.tn.gov/content/dam/tn/thec/tsac_bm/september-2016/September_27_TSAC_Board_-_Combined.pdf
- The Center for Michigan (2020). *No Substitute: The Public's Agenda to Reduce Michigan's Reliance on Uncertified, Long-Term Substitute Teachers*. Retrieved from: <https://thecenterformichigan.net/public-engagement/>.
- The Professional Education Standards Board (2019). Recruiting Washington Teachers Annual Report. Retrieved from: <https://drive.google.com/file/d/16rNXPiTnef51Bq0w9VixxfRbTCiHCHpA/view>.

Appendix A. Program Strategies Aligned to Focus Areas

					
GROW YOUR OWN	EDUCATOR PREP MODIFICATIONS	CERTIFICATION PROCESS CHANGE	MARKETING	DIVERSITY	FINANCIAL INCENTIVES
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • District & IHE partnership • Teacher residency • Coaching/mentoring • Support for rural/urban communities • Induction support • Teacher cadet • Preparation for licensure exams • Job placement • Teacher preparation curriculum • Centralized job bank • Job placement • Articulation agreements 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Teacher residency • Coaching/mentoring • Induction support • Teacher cadet • Preparation for licensure exams 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Teacher residency • Teacher cadet • Preparation for licensure exams • Alternate admission requirements 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • District & IHE partnership • Centralized job bank • Online career information • Advertising campaign 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • District & IHE partnership • Teacher residency • Coaching/mentoring • Support for rural/urban communities • Preparation for licensure exams • Job placement • Teacher preparation curriculum • Centralized job bank • Online career information • Loans/loan forgiveness • Scholarships • Job placement • Articulation agreements 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tuition remission • Loans/loan forgiveness • Scholarships • Paid student teaching • Program grants • Housing and living stipends

Appendix B. List of Programs Reviewed

State	Program
AK	State Teacher Loan Forgiveness
AL	Alabama Teacher Mentoring Program
AL	UABTeach
AR	Teach Arkansas (campaign)
AZ	State and University Teacher Academy
AZ	Teacher Academy
CA	Make the Switch: Become a Teacher (campaign)
CA	San Francisco Teaching Residency Program
CA	California Center on Teaching Careers*
CA	Differentiated Compensation
CA	Governor's Teaching Fellowship & Assumption Program of Loans for Education
CA	Integrated Teacher Preparation Program Grant (high-need areas)
CA	Paraprofessional Teacher Training Program
CA	Teacher Recruitment and Retention Act
CA	The Multilingual/Multicultural Teacher Preparation Center (M/M Center)
CO	Pathways to Teaching
CO	ASPIRE
CO	Boettcher Teacher Residency
CO	Colorado Teacher Cadets and the Center for Rural Education at the University of Northern Colorado
CO	Incentives for Rural Teachers
CO	Teach Colorado
CO	Troops to Teachers Program
CT	Mortgage Assistance Program
DC	Join DC Public Schools
DE	New data collection requirements for TPP
FL	Minority Teacher Education Scholars (MTES) program
FL	Critical Teacher Shortage Program
HI	Leeward Community College Teacher Education Program
IL	Minority Teachers of Illinois Scholarship Program
IL	Chicago's Bilingual Teacher Residency Program
IL	Teacher Loan Forgiveness
KY	Minority Educator Recruitment and Retention Scholarship*
LA	Be a Teacher LA (campaign)
LA	Believe and Prepare
MA	Boston Public Schools' High School to Teacher Program
MA	Boston Teacher Residency
MN	Collaborative Urban and Greater Minnesota Educators of Color Grant Program
MO	Missouri Minority Teaching Scholarship
MS	Teacher Center
MT	Stone Child College 2+2 program

State	Program
NC	Teaching Fellow/Teacher Cadet Programs
NC	UNC Educator Quality Dashboard
NJ	ECSU 2+2 Program
NJ	Paterson Teachers for Tomorrow
NV	Tuition Assistance
NY	High School for Teaching and the Professions
OH	Teaching Academy (exemplar)
OK	Bilingual Teacher Pipeline Project (BTPP)*
OK	Future Scholarship
OK	Teacher Shortage Employment Incentive Program (STEM)
OR	Chemeketa Community College Bilingual Teacher Pathway
OR	Noyce Scholarship (STEM)
OR	Oregon Teacher Pathway
OR	Oregon Teacher Scholars*
OR	Portland PS & Portland State University Dual Language Teacher Partnership
SC	Governor's Teaching Scholarship Loan Program
SC	S.C.'s Dedication to Education
SC	Call Me MISTER
SC	Program of Alternative Certification for Educators/Teacher Loan Forgiveness
SC	Teacher Fellow/Teacher Cadet Programs (Statewide)
SD	Legislated Statewide Average Compensation & State Service Scholarship
SD	Paraprofessional Program
TN	State Collaborative on Reforming Education (SCORE)
TN	edTPA scores in lieu of taking the Praxis exam
TN	EPP Annual Reports
TN	Innovation Grants to EPPs
TN	Math and Science Teacher Loan Forgiveness
TN	Memphis Teacher Residency
TN	Minority Teaching Fellows Program*
TN	River City Partnership
TN	Teach Today. Change Tomorrow
TN	Teaching as a Profession
TX	#IAmTXEd (Social campaign)
TX	Academy for Teacher Excellence*
TX	Project FUTURE
VA	Teachers for Tomorrow (Cadets)
WA	The Pipeline for Paraeducators Conditional Loan Scholarship Program
WA	Recruiting Washington Teachers
WI	Minority Teacher Loan Program*
Multi	UTEACH
Multi	Educator Rising

* Initiative includes an emphasis on diversifying the workforce.

Appendix C. Detailed Methodology

To complete this scan, the Region 8 Comprehensive Center (CC) team worked closely with the Michigan Department of Education (MDE) to identify an area of focus: Improve our understanding of programs and initiatives focused on expanding the teacher pipeline.

After identifying a focus, the Region 8 CC team engaged in a review of literature (both published and unpublished) and publicly available program information. To support in the review and analysis of findings, we convened groups at several levels within the Region 8 CC team. Teams were responsible for generating content (scanning), evaluating the appropriateness of the source, reviewing sources and capturing pertinent data, organizing and arranging findings, and examining synthesized results.

To guide and focus our review of available data and in a manner that aligned with the focus areas, we developed an inquiry framework, looking specifically to use collected information to answer the following questions:

- ◀ What policies/initiatives exist for increasing enrollment in teacher preparation programs?
- ◀ Who is leading the work?
- ◀ How effective are they? What does the data show?

The team searched documents published from 2007 through 2020, including those articles describing initiatives that had not shown success or had been discontinued. We developed search terms across a range of categories including teacher pipeline initiatives, teacher recruitment, diversity program, teacher training and certification programs, and financial incentives. To capture data sources, the team created a data base in MS Excel. The database housed bibliographic details, preliminary information on alignment to focal areas, and initiative names and state of implementation.

We searched for articles that included terms and keywords from any of the categories. We searched the following major electronic databases: EBSCOHost, JSTOR, Sage, and Google Scholar. Google search engine was used to locate program initiative websites or other pertinent information that could not be found via published article. We reviewed articles to determine whether they were eligible for inclusion. Inclusion criteria were the following:

- ◀ Articles contained information on initiatives aligned with key focus areas or would be useful to answering one or all focus questions.
- ◀ Articles described key program components inclusive of implementation data or information on funding sources.
- ◀ Articles that only described challenges and barriers without discussing initiatives and programs created to address them were excluded.

Questions about inclusion were addressed during the source evaluation process, after sources were logged in the database, prior to deep review and capturing findings. We reviewed a total of 80 initiatives screening 176 articles and program websites. Data collected from the scan of initiatives were validated and triangulated using email inquiries. Program administrators were asked to share additional information on their initiatives funding sources or evidence of effectiveness. This report captures the synthesis of article scan, website reviews and program administrator input (where applicable). The 27 programs presented in this report were chosen for the following reasons:

- ◀ Relevance to scan areas of focus;
- ◀ Availability of information on strategies, funding, evidence of effectiveness; or
- ◀ Alignment with key areas of interest for MDE.

